

PLN CDR draft: Issue 1

Gleefre

July 6, 2024

1 Issue 1 (ADD-/REMOVE-PACKAGE-LOCAL-NICKNAME return values)

1.1 Description

Functions `add-package-local-nickname` and `remove-package-local-nickname` have inconsistent return values.

The first one always returns the *designated package*, while the second one returns *true* (a *generalized boolean*) that indicates whether a nickname was removed.

Furthermore, there is no consensus among existing implementations as to what this *generalized boolean* represents.

In comparison, the functions `use-package` and `unuse-package` always return `T`, and the functions `export` and `unexport` have the same behavior. There are also functions `unintern` and `delete-package` which return a *generalized boolean* indicating if the operation changed something, but their counterparts `intern` and `make-package`, unlike with local nicknames, create and return an *object* (a *symbol* or a *package*).

1.2 Examples

```
(defpackage #:foo (:use))
(defpackage #:bar (:use))

(add-package-local-nickname '#:nick '#:bar '#:foo)
; => #<PACKAGE "FOO"> (sbcl, ccl, ecl, acl, abcl, clasp, lispworks)
(add-package-local-nickname '#:nick '#:bar '#:foo)
; => #<PACKAGE "FOO"> (sbcl, ccl, ecl, acl, abcl, clasp, lispworks)
(remove-package-local-nickname '#:nick '#:foo)
; => T (sbcl, ccl, ecl, acl, clasp)
; => #<PACKAGE "BAR"> (abcl)
; => NIL (lispworks)
(remove-package-local-nickname '#:nick '#:foo)
; => NIL (sbcl, ccl, ecl, acl, abcl, clasp, lispworks)
```

1.3 Current behavior

`sbcl, ccl, ecl, acl, abcl, clasp, lispworks`: `add-package-local-nickname` always returns *designated package*.

sbcl, ccl, ecl, acl, clasp: `remove-package-local-nickname` returns T if a nickname was removed, and NIL otherwise.

abcl: `remove-package-local-nickname` returns *true* if a nickname was removed, (more specifically, it returns the package nicknamed by the removed local nickname), and NIL otherwise.

lispworks: `remove-package-local-nickname` always returns NIL.

1.4 Proposal ALWAYS-T

`add-package-local-nickname` should always return T.

`remove-package-local-nickname` should always return T.

1.5 Proposal ELIMINATE-GENERALIZED-BOOLEAN

`add-package-local-nickname` should return the *designated package*.

`remove-package-local-nickname` should return T if a nickname was removed and NIL otherwise.

1.6 Proposal DESIGNATED-PACKAGE-IF-SUCCESSFUL

`add-package-local-nickname` should return the *designated package* if a new nickname was added, and NIL otherwise.

`remove-package-local-nickname` should return the *designated package* if a nickname was removed, and NIL otherwise.

1.7 Proposal NICKNAMED-PACKAGE-IF-SUCCESSFUL

`add-package-local-nickname` should return the *nicknamed package* if a new nickname was added, and NIL otherwise.

`remove-package-local-nickname` should return the previously *nicknamed package* if a nickname was removed, and NIL otherwise.